**Scottish Food Enforcement Liaison Committee minute**Friday 16 February 2018: 10:00 for 10:30
**Venue**: SG Buildings, Victoria Quay, Edinburgh EH6 6QQ. Tel: 0300 244 4000 or 07881 281 206.

**Members present**

William Hamilton (Chair) Scottish Food Enforcement Liaison Committee

Catherine Ferro (Secretariat) Scottish Food Enforcement Liaison Committee

George Brechin (GBrechin) Food Standards Scotland Board Member (observer)

Lindsay Matthew (LMatthew) SFELC Vice Chair & Convention of Scottish Local Authorities

Martin Keeley Royal Environment Health Institute of Scotland

Andrea Carson (ACarson) North of Scotland Food Liaison Group Chair

Jane Couper (JCouper) Food Standards Subcommittee Chair

Jane White (JWhite) Association of Public Analysts

Andrew Morrison (AMorrison) Food Safety Subcommittee Chair

Ryan Bruce (RBruce) Speaker from Food Standards Scotland

Paul Bradley (PBradley) SFELC Honorary Secretary

Izzy Childs (IChilds) Lothian and Borders Food Liaison Group Chair

Bruce McCall (BMcCall) Scottish Federation of Meat Traders Association

Helen Henderson (HHenderson) East of Scotland Food Liaison Group Chair

Rachel Mirfatahhi (RMirfatahi) Institute of Food Science and Technology

Gerry Fallon (GFallon) Speaker, Chair of Artisan Cheesemakers WG

Maureen McLarty (MMcLarty) Feedingstuffs Subcommitte Chair

Lorna Murray (LMurray) Food Standards Scotland

1. **Chairman’s welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair opened the meeting by welcoming the Committee, speakers and guests to the February 2018 Scottish Food Enforcement Liaison Committee (SFELC) meeting in Edinburgh commenting we are in the same room as SFELC was held in, in February 2017.

Chair ran through the house keeping arrangements and advised the meeting would be recorded only to aid the writing of an accurate minute.

He welcomed speakers; deputy attendee Bruce McCall in place of Douglas Scott of SFMTA; the new LBFLG Chair Izzy Childs who has now taken over from Craig Smith; and George Brechin an observer attending from the FSS Board. He also introduced known faces Gerry Fallon and Ryan Bruce to give updates respectively for agenda items 4.1 on the Artisan Cheesemakers working group and item 4.2 on CLIO and efficacy of recalls.

Apologies were recorded for; Chris McGuigan, CPHM; Derek Oliver, SOCOEHS rep & Food Crime Working Group Chair; Ian McWatt, FSS; Joe Harkin, WSFLG Chair.

1. **Minutes and matters arising**

The Chair advised that the draft minutes of the meeting held in Dundee on 08 December 2017 had been circulated, and proposed that the Committee go through the minutes page by page, first for accuracy (A) and then matters arising (MA).

There were neither corrections for accuracy nor any matters arising.

1. **Actions outstanding**
	* Action 22.2017 – October 2017 – Regarding the SG Regulatory Reform code of practice review, SG team will send questionnaire link to Secretariat to circulate as reminder to SFELC individuals for their input – COMPLETED.
	* Action 28.2017 – October 2017 – Regarding the FSS Code of Practice, Annex 5 review, SFELC Secretariat will circulate the annex 5 project initiation document – COMPLETED
	* Action 29.2017 – October 2017 – both the Food Standards Subcommittee and the SFMTA are liaising with regards to the document entitled “minimising carryover”. COMPLETED. To be brought to SFELC for final approval once agreed.
	* Actions 30.2017 – 32.2017 – December 2017 – COMPLETE.

-DNHWG has opened its KHub group, contents are now available for all to see. -DNHWG have uploaded their MenuCal pilot report to their KHub page.

-QMU Masters Nutrition students have been invited to attend a DNHWG meeting and to discuss the schools work with Paul Birkin who carried out schools nutrition work in the Shettleston area of Glasgow.

* Action 33.2017 – December 2017 – SFELC Secretariat sent all SFELC individuals access to the SFLC KHub page. COMPLETE.
* Action 34.2017 – December 2017 – SFELC Secretariat to arrange for KHub training for RWG, FLG Chairs for Thursday 19 April 2018. ONGOING.
* Action 35.2017 – December 2017 – SOLACE report to be circulated to all FLG Chairs.

Full details of all actions completed prior to this meeting are available in the separate actions document, “SFELC - Papers – Action Points – date”.

1. **Presentations & Current Items**

**4.1 Artisan Cheesemakers short life working group.**

*GFallon* began his presentation with a recap of why this SFELC working group was initiated, detailing an incident concerning cheese in summer 2016 and FSS letter ENF/16/15 and a consultation. Then he noted the draft officer guidance had been progressing until legal proceedings required its suspension for a time. There have been and are still several workstreams involving FSS / SFELC and the specialist cheesemakers association (SCA). This work including a literature review had raised challenges concerning raw milk supply and validation. *GFallon* discussed the new enforcement decision tree on the “production of cheese from unpasteurised milk” the working group have created and talked it through to the Committee.

Moving forward he discussed the next steps are to consider the consultation responses; finalise the guidance; learn from the incident; and produce the joint FSS/SFELC best practice guidance. At which point he asked if there were any questions.

*JWhite* asked whether the scope of the documents are E. coli O157 only or if the scope also contains STECs. *GFallon* agreed only O157 was included as these samples were available to go to the labs.

*MKeeley* asked how *GFallon* feels about the situation. To which he replied it’s not a good place to be, similar to being between a rock and a hard place. *LMurray* added the workshop on 7 February 2018 discussed the situation and could not conclude a single answer, but instead noted there need to be multiple answers. For example SCA are aware there is lots of work to be done between themselves and their members. FSS, SCA and working group are aware they all need to work together amongst themselves and the cheese producing businesses, as had been the situation the “less than thoroughly cooked burgers” WG had been in a few years earlier. *GFallon* agreed there is much to do not least the IMT report guidance document is to be produced.

*PBradley* asked how many artisan cheese producers in Scotland follow the SCA handbook which is very much based in England, bearing in mind there seem to be diverging paths in Scotland and in England. *GFallon* stated the SCA are aware of this potential divergence.

*WHamilton* then thanked *GFallon* for his presentation and for the hard work the working group has put in to date, including that it must have been a steep learning curve to become so thoroughly involved in understanding the science behind safe cheese. Also noted was the delivery of the two (2) HACCP in artisan cheese makers training course in 2017.

*LMurray* agreed ther is a lot of scientific expertise to be understood not just by the LA officers but also by the FBOs. Some of the artisanal cheesemakers are small businesses, but others are exporters and are therefore significant producers who will need to accept they too will have to increase their understanding of the science.

Chair then introduced Ryan Bruce a former Secretariat to SFELC, but now the FSS Incidents Manger.

**4.2 Update of the Central Logging of Incident / Intelligence Operations (CLIO) and Efficacy of recalls.**

*RBruce* explained that CLIO is widely used in the UK for gathering information, especially around major sporting events, that it has made a massive improvement in the Incident teams’ ability to work in comparison to the previously used Memex system. He logged into the system to give a demonstration to the Committee.

He noted the events that have lead up to this point including Phases 1 & 2, but now going into Phase 3 of the CLIO project, that he is looking for LA partners to become involved in a pilot of the scheme which would only take a few months, for example should be complete by end May 2018.

**ACTION 01.2018 – LAs interested in being involved in the CLIO pilot to contact Ryan Bruce on** **Incidents@fss.scot****.**

At which point *RBruce* invites questions. *AMorrison*, having formerly been in FSS incidents team manager, acknowledged the CLIO system is a huge step forward and offered Aberdeen City Council to be involved in the pilot. Additionally he asked a number of question; whether FSA will continue to use memex for cross border incidents or will have access to CLIO? And what will LAs do? *RBruce* answered that yes FSA would be given access to the relevant sections of CLIO when working on Scottish led UK incidents, and it would also be the case that LAs would be given access to the CLIO incident logs they are involved in across Scotland.

*MMcLarty* asks whether CLIO works equally for food and feed issues, to which the response is also yes. *MKeeley* asked whether the CLIO system would work equally on mobile device as on computer desktop, again to which the answer is yes CLIO works on any computer / mobile device that has wifi. Both *MMcLarty* and *MKeeley* put their authority forward for the pilot. South Ayrshire and West Dunbartonshire respectively.

*RBruce* then moves onto the second part of his presentation, Efficacy of Recalls, where he explains SFELC has had a member in the FSA/FSS Efficacy of Recalls Steering Group until now and will continue going forward, additionally there will also be the need for local authority individuals to become a member of the FSA/FSS Efficacy of Recalls working groups. The reason for the additional working groups is that a project of English speaking countries was carried out and the UK did not compare well to the other countries in the study. For the large part because the guidance is out of date.

**ACTION 02.2018 – Ryan Bruce to send Secretariat the documents, the findings of the Efficacy of Recalls Steering Group project, to be uploaded to KHub.**

**ACTION 03.2018 – Secretariat to collate names volunteering for the efficacy of recalls working groups.**

There were no further questions for either speaker. As such Chair thanked the speakers for their useful information and strengthened the requests for volunteers to join the working groups.

1. **Intelligence gathering – safe spaces**

No discussion.

1. **Resources Working Group Update**

MKeeley gave a brief overview of the previous day’s RWG meeting including;

NB. Full details of all RWG actions are recorded in the RWG actions log which are available in the separate actions document, “SFELC - Resources Working Group - Papers - Action points – date”.

**ACTION 04.2018 – FLG Chairs to ask for appropriate reps to join the new “short term imports / exports working group”.**

**ACTION 05.2018 – FLG Chairs to ask for appropriate reps to join the new “short term additional official controls working group”. Also to find a group Chair.**

**ACTION 06.2018 – Food Crime Advisory Group (i) to arrange a meeting of the Food Crime advisory group before SFELC April 2018, (ii) so they can review the food crime MOU, (iii) and then get agreement with the whole of SFELC at the at April SFELC.**

**ACTION 07.2018 – FLG Chairs to advise their groups there is a specialist officers network (SON) KHub page.**

1. **Committee work plan**

*Chair* noted the work plan has been circulated and can be viewed on KHub.

1. **Food Standards Scotland update**

*LMurray* gave a brief overview of the FSS profile projects including

1. **Sub- Committees**

*Chair* welcomed all 3 Subcommittee Chairs and asked if there were any items outwith the highlight report they would like to update upon.

*AMorrison* apologised for there not having been a Food Safety Subcommittee meeting, but declared there would be a meeting between this and the next SFELC.

*JCouper* noted the next meeting of the Food Standards Subcommittee is to take place in March.

*Chair* welcomed *MMcLarty* as Chair of the Feedingstuffs Subcommittee following there having been a void in their attendance due to the ongoing work to determine how official controls for feed would progress in Scotland. *MMcLarty* explained the jury is still out regarding whether the LAs will be taking forward feed work or not, discussions are attempting to bring in Regulations for FSS to be the Feed competent authority. There has been a consultation, “The Feed Enforcement (Scotland) Regulations 2018” (consultation summary [link](https://consult.foodstandards.gov.scot/enforcement-delivery/feed-enforcement-scotland-regulations-2018/results/summaryofconsultationresponses-feed-february2018.pdf)). She also mentioned annex 10 of the 2015 FSS food law code of practice ([link](http://www.foodstandards.gov.scot/downloads/Food_Law_Code_of_Practice__Scotland_.pdf) annex 10 on page 179) discusses various aspects. It may be that there could be 7 lead feed authorities in Scotland as opposed to 1 in each of the 32 councils.

1. **Food Liaison Groups**

*Chair* then asked whether FLG Chairs has items to raise that were not noted in the Highlight Reports on KHub ([link](https://khub.net/group/scottish-food-enforcement-liaison-committee/group-library)). Any questions on these should be directed to the relevant Chairs.

*ACarson* added the NSFLG has created its own KHub group.

There were no further updates from FLGs.

**Exception reporting**

1. **Update by Non-Enforcement members**

There were no items scheduled for this agenda item.

**Information papers**

1. **Review of action points**

Secretariat ran through the action points and matters of record raised throughout this meeting. Action points are noted in bold red and, matters of record noted with green highlight throughout this document.

Full details of all actions completed prior to this meeting are available in the separate actions document, “SFELC - Papers – Action Points – date”.

Additionally actions for RWG are noted in the RWG actions log, “SFELC - Resources Working Group - Papers - Action points – date”.

1. **AOCB**

There was one item raised under AOCB. *BMcCall* asked whether it is ok for LA officers to video FBO working? The general consensus across the committee was that filming in food businesses is ok, however it is common courtesy for the LA officers asked to ask permission first.

*Chair* thanked all for attending this SFELC which finished promptly early at 12:40. He advised the next meeting would be 20 April in FSS offices, Pilgrim House, in Aberdeen. He then closed the meeting.

**Forthcoming meetings**

20 April 2018: Meeting to be held in Aberdeen (Pilgrim House)

22 June 2018: Meeting to be held in Perth (Mercure hotel)

05 October 2018: Meeting to be held in Aberdeen (Pilgrim House)

07 December 2018: Meeting to be held in Glasgow (Atlantic Quay)

08 February 2019: Meeting to be held in Edinburgh (St Andrews House)

Please advise Catherine Ferro on SFELC@fss.scot if you are aware of other events that SFELC delegates may attend that clash with these dates.